

# EXHIBIT 8

116TH CONGRESS  
*1st Session*

SENATE

REPORT  
116-XX

(U) R E P O R T  
OF THE  
SELECT COMMITTEE ON INTELLIGENCE  
UNITED STATES SENATE  
ON  
RUSSIAN ACTIVE MEASURES CAMPAIGNS AND INTERFERENCE  
IN THE 2016 U.S. ELECTION  
VOLUME 5: COUNTERINTELLIGENCE THREATS AND  
VULNERABILITIES

**COMMITTEE SENSITIVE – RUSSIA INVESTIGATION ONLY**

**C O N T E N T S**

|      |  |     |
|------|--|-----|
| I.   | (U) FINDINGS .....   | v   |
| II.  | (U) METHODOLOGY .....  | 1   |
| A.   | (U) The Committee’s Authority and Focus .....                                      | 1   |
| 1.   | (U) The Committee’s Power to Investigate .....                                     | 1   |
| 2.   | (U) The Committee’s Counterintelligence Focus .....                                | 4   |
| B.   | (U) A Bipartisan Investigation .....   | 5   |
| C.   | (U) Legal Issues Encountered .....   | 7   |
| 1.   | (U) Executive Privilege .....  | 8   |
| 2.   | (U) A Claimed Transition Privilege .....   | 9   |
| 3.   | (U) Obstruction, Attorney-Client Privilege, and the Joint Defense Agreement .....  | 14  |
| 4.   | (U) Fifth Amendment and Immunity .....   | 17  |
| 5.   | (U) Extraterritoriality .....  | 20  |
| 6.   | (U) Committee Access to Electronic Communications Data .....                       | 21  |
| 7.   | (U) Other Issues: First Amendment and Spousal Privilege .....                      | 23  |
| 8.   | (U) Transcript Review .....  | 23  |
| D.   | (U) Working With and Around the Executive Branch .....                             | 24  |
| 1.   | (U) DOJ, FBI, and SCO .....  | 24  |
| 2.   | (U) Access to and Use of Classified Materials in the Report .....                  | 26  |
| III. | (U) COUNTERINTELLIGENCE CONCERNS .....   | 27  |
| A.   | (U) Paul Manafort .....  | 27  |
| 1.   | (U) Introduction and Findings .....  | 27  |
| 2.   | (U) Limitations on the Committee’s Investigation .....                             | 30  |
| 3.   | (U) Background on Manafort’s Foreign Activities .....                              | 32  |
| 4.   | (U) Manafort’s Activities from 2014 until Joining the Trump Campaign .....         | 47  |
| 5.   | (U) Manafort’s Activities While Serving on the Trump Campaign .....                | 53  |
| 6.   | (U) Manafort’s Activities For the Remainder of the Campaign .....                  | 92  |
| 7.   | (U) Manafort’s Activities After the Election .....                                 | 96  |
| 8.   | (U) Manafort’s Associates’ Ties to Russian Intelligence Services .....             | 137 |
| B.   | (U) Hack and Leak .....  | 170 |
| 1.   | (U) Introduction and Findings .....  | 170 |
| 2.   | (U) Limitations on the Committee’s Investigation .....                             | 173 |
| 3.   | (U) Background on GRU Hacking Activities .....                                     | 174 |
| 4.   | (U) The GRU Plans and Executes the Theft of Sensitive Political Documents .....    | 178 |
| 5.   | (U) Russia “Weaponizes” Stolen Information with Fake Personas .....                | 182 |
| 6.   | (U) Russia and WikiLeaks Coordinate On Interference in the U.S. Election .....     | 199 |
| 7.   | (U) Efforts to Capitalize on WikiLeaks, Gain Advance Information on Releases ..... | 221 |
| C.   | (U) The Agalarovs and the June 9, 2016 Trump Tower Meeting .....                   | 259 |
| 1.   | (U) Introduction and Findings .....  | 259 |
| 2.   | (U) Background on the Agalarovs .....  | 261 |

**COMMITTEE SENSITIVE – RUSSIA INVESTIGATION ONLY**

|    |  |     |
|----|--|-----|
| 3. | (U) Origins of the Trump-Agalarov Relationship .....                             | 268 |
| 4. | (U) The Trump-Agalarov Relationship During the 2016 Presidential Campaign .....  | 311 |
| 5. | (U) The June 9, 2016 Trump Tower Meeting .....                                   | 322 |
| 6. | (U) Subsequent Events and Communications .....                                   | 373 |
| 7. | (U) Artem Klyushin, Konstantin Rykov, and Associates .....                       | 395 |
| D. | (U) Trump Tower Moscow .....   | 407 |
| 1. | (U) Introduction and Findings .....  | 407 |
| 2. | (U) Past Efforts to Conduct a Real Estate Deal in Russia with Felix Sater .....  | 408 |
| 3. | (U) Trump Tower Moscow Projects During the 2016 Presidential Campaign .....      | 419 |
| 4. | (U) Efforts to Mislead the Public and Congress about Trump Tower Moscow .....    | 461 |
| E. | (U) George Papadopoulos .....  | 464 |
| 1. | (U) Introduction and Findings .....  | 464 |
| 2. | (U) Limitations on the Committee's Investigation .....                           | 467 |
| 3. | (U) Joseph Mifsud and Other Central Figures .....                                | 468 |
| 4. | (U) Papadopoulos Engages with Foreign Governments, Inflating Campaign Role ...   | 470 |
| 5. | (U) Counterintelligence Concerns about Papadopoulos's Interactions .....         | 524 |
| F. | (U) Carter Page .....  | 527 |
| 1. | (U) Introduction and Findings .....  | 527 |
| 2. | (U) Background on Page and Limitations on the Committee's Investigation .....    | 528 |
| 3. | (U) Page and U.S. and Russian Intelligence Services .....                        | 530 |
| 4. | (U) Page and the Trump Campaign .....  | 533 |
| 5. | (U) Page Returns to Russia, December 2016 .....                                  | 555 |
| 6. | (U) Page During the Transition .....   | 557 |
| 7. | (U) Page in the "Steele Dossier" .....   | 558 |
| G. | (U) Trump's Foreign Policy Speech at the Mayflower Hotel .....                   | 560 |
| 1. | (U) Introduction and Findings .....  | 560 |
| 2. | (U) The Mayflower Speech .....   | 561 |
| H. | (U) Maria Butina and Alexander Torshin .....                                     | 568 |
| 1. | (U) Introduction and Findings .....  | 568 |
| 2. | (U) Background on Maria Butina and Alexander Torshin .....                       | 570 |
| 3. | (U) Torshin and Butina Establish Relations with the NRA .....                    | 580 |
| 4. | (U) Torshin and Butina Leverage NRA Relationships .....                          | 586 |
| 5. | (U) Torshin and Butina Pursue Political Contacts with Russian Approval .....     | 608 |
| 6. | (U) 2016 NRA Convention and Efforts to Pursue Contact with Trump .....           | 614 |
| 7. | (U) Efforts to Establish a U.S.-Russia Communications Channel .....              | 625 |
| 8. | (U) After the Election and the 2017 National Prayer Breakfast .....              | 630 |
| I. | (U) Allegations, and Potential Misinformation, About Compromising Information..  | 636 |
| 1. | (U) Introduction and Findings .....  | 636 |
| 2. | (U) Threat Posed by Russian Intelligence Services' Collection of Kompromat ..... | 639 |
| 3. | (U) David Geovanis and Potential Counterintelligence Concerns .....              | 641 |
| 4. | (U) Trump's Travel to Moscow in 1996 .....                                       | 647 |
| 5. | (U) Trump's Travel to Moscow in 2013 .....                                       | 655 |

**COMMITTEE SENSITIVE – RUSSIA INVESTIGATION ONLY**

|       |   |     |
|-------|---|-----|
| J.    | (U) Influence for Hire .....  | 663 |
| 1.    | (U) Introduction and Findings .....   | 663 |
| 2.    | (U) SCL and Cambridge Analytica.....  | 664 |
| 3.    | (U) Psy Group .....   | 679 |
| 4.    | (U) Colt Ventures and VizSense.....   | 694 |
| K.    | (U) Transition.....   | 702 |
| 1.    | (U) Introduction and Findings .....   | 702 |
| 2.    | (U) Trump Transition Holds Meetings and Calls with Russian Officials .....        | 703 |
| 3.    | (U) Kirill Dmitriev Pursues Inroads to the Transition Team .....                  | 718 |
| 4.    | (U) Robert Foresman .....   | 735 |
| 5.    | (U) Michael Flynn.....  | 752 |
| L.    | (U) Other Incidents and Persons of Interest.....                                  | 777 |
| 1.    | (U) Peter W. Smith .....  | 777 |
| 2.    | (U) The Alfa Bank Server Story .....  | 787 |
| 3.    | (U) Changes to the RNC's Platform .....   | 792 |
| 4.    | (U) Russia's Efforts to Support Third Party Candidates .....                      | 802 |
| IV.   | (U) EXECUTIVE BRANCH INVESTIGATIONS.....  | 811 |
| A.    | (U) The DNC Hack and FBI's Response .....   | 815 |
| 1.    | (U) Introduction and Findings .....   | 815 |
| 2.    | (U) FBI's Role Responding to Nation-State Cyber Attacks on Private Entities ..... | 816 |
| 3.    | (U) FBI's Role: The Victim-Driven Response .....                                  | 817 |
| 4.    | (U) Private Cybersecurity Vendors.....  | 819 |
| 5.    | (U) Summary of Events .....   | 821 |
| 6.    | (U) Detailed Timeline .....   | 822 |
| 7.    | (U) Conclusions .....   | 842 |
| B.    | (U) The Steele Dossier: Its Origins and Handling .....                            | 846 |
| 1.    | (U) Introduction and Findings .....   | 846 |
| 2.    | (U) Examining the Steele Dossier's Creation and Sourcing.....                     | 853 |
| 3.    | (U) The Dossier's Origins.....  | 856 |
| 4.    | (U) Examining the Dossier's Sources and Tradecraft .....                          | 865 |
| 5.    | (U) FBI's Handling of the Dossier.....  | 893 |
| 6.    | (U) Other Recipients of the Dossier.....  | 908 |
| V.    | (U) RECOMMENDATIONS .....   | 931 |
| VI.   | (U) ANNEX A .....   | 938 |
| VII.  | (U) ANNEX B .....   | 939 |
| VIII. | (U) ANNEX C .....   | 940 |
|       | Additional Views of Senators Risch, Rubio, Blunt, Cotton, Cornyn, and Sasse.....  | 941 |
|       | Additional Views of Senators Heinrich, Feinstein, Wyden, Harris, and Bennet.....  | 943 |
|       | Additional Views of Senator Wyden.....  | 949 |

[REDACTED]

**COMMITTEE SENSITIVE – RUSSIA INVESTIGATION ONLY**

know the value of the contract.<sup>4414</sup> [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

- [REDACTED] **Dmitri Rybolovlev:** Psy Group undertook a separate “intelligence project” in 2016 for Dmitry Rybolovlev relating to a dispute with the art dealer Yves Bouvier. Walter Soriano linked Rybolovlev with Psy Group to find derogatory information on Bouvier, possibly by suggesting that Bouvier was using his art dealing to skim money from customers. The contract value was approximately \$150,000, and entailed Invop’s conducting open source research on Bouvier. Burstien did not recall meeting Rybolovlev, though another Psy Group employee probably did, and stated that Soriano would have been present for that meeting.<sup>4416</sup> [REDACTED]
- [REDACTED]

**iii. (U) Psy Group’s Engagement with the Trump Campaign: Project Rome/D-Day**

(U) In the spring of 2016, Psy Group pitched an influence and intelligence project to the Trump Campaign through Rick Gates and Birnbaum. Referred to as both “Project Rome and “Project D-Day,” the proposal was developed over several months, but ultimately never came to fruition, as described below.

(U) On March 23, 2016, Kory Bardash, the head of Republicans in Israel, emailed George Birnbaum and Eitan Charnoff, a project manager at Psy Group, to virtually introduce them to each other. Bardash wrote: “I have spoken to both of you about the other. Hopefully you can have a mutually beneficial chat.”<sup>4418</sup>

(U) Separately, on March 29, 2016, Birnbaum met with Rick Gates at the Mandarin Oriental hotel in Washington, D.C., having been introduced to Gates by mutual friend Eckart

---

<sup>4414</sup> (U) Attorney Proffer, Burstien, April 12, 2019. [REDACTED]

<sup>4415</sup> [REDACTED]

<sup>4416</sup> (U) Attorney Proffer, Burstien, April 12, 2019. [REDACTED]

<sup>4417</sup> [REDACTED]

<sup>4418</sup> (U) Email, Bardash to Birnbaum and Charnoff, March 23, 2016 (PSY000005–PSY000006).